

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

GREGORY HEARN, *et al.* : **CIVIL ACTION**

: **NO. 02-3525**

vs. :

:

BRIAN FUSS, *et al.* :

DEFENDANTS REPLY BRIEF ON DAMAGES PURSUANT TO 42 U.S.C. §

I. ARGUMENT

Defendants will not argue with plaintiffs' Brief and its summary of the case law regarding a spouses right to bring a loss of consortium type 42 U.S.C. §1983. However, plaintiff Dana Hearn's right to bring such a claim in this matter is a non issue. Similar to the wife seeking to advance a consortium type §1983 claim in *Pahle v. Colebrookdale Township*, 227 F.Supp 2d 361 (E.D.Pa. 2002), wherein Judge Van Antwerpen asserted a belief that a spouse may assert such a claim and thereafter held that the wife did not adequately plead the claim, Dana Hearn did not plead a consortium type §1983 claim in the Complaint. In fact, Mrs. Hearn did not plead a common law loss of consortium claim.

II. CONCLUSION

Dana Hearn, having failed to adequately plead a claim for damages due to any violation of her Fourteenth Amendment liberty interest in maintenance and integrity of her family

relationship, is not entitled to maintain such a claim.

Respectfully submitted,

CITY OF PHILADELPHIA - LAW DEPARTMENT
NELSON A. DIAZ
City Solicitor

By:

EDWARD D. CHEW, JR.

Senior Attorney

1515 Arch Street - 14th Floor

Philadelphia, PA 19102-1595

215.683.5420

fax 215.683.5397

e-mail edward.chew@phila.gov

Attorney for the Municipal Defendant(s)

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

GREGORY HEARN, <i>et al.</i>	:	CIVIL ACTION
	:	NO. 02-3525
vs.	:	
	:	
BRIAN FUSS, <i>et al.</i>	:	

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Edward D. Chew, Jr., Senior Attorney, hereby certify that on the date below indicated, a copy of the attached pleading was delivered to the following counsel by first-class mail.

Gerald Grant, Esq.
1617 J.F.K. Boulevard – Suite 800
Philadelphia, PA 19103

Date: December 11, 2003

**CITY OF PHILADELPHIA - LAW DEPARTMENT
NELSON A. DIAZ
City Solicitor**

By: _____
EDWARD D. CHEW, JR.
Senior Attorney
1515 Arch Street - 14th Floor
Philadelphia, PA 19102-1595
215.683.5420
fax 215.683.5397
e-mail edward.chew@phila.gov

Attorney for the Municipal Defendant(s)